DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 365 665 SP 034 961

AUTHOR	Etheridge, Carol Plata; And Others
TITLE	Review of Research Comparing Teacher Education Programs.
SPONS AGENCY	Memphis State Univ., Tennessee. Center for Research in Educational Policy.
PUB DATE	Aug 93
NOTE	39p.
PUB TYPE	Information Analyses (070)
EDRS PRICE	MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS	Comparative Analysis; *Educational Research; Elementary Secondary Education; Higher Education; Literature Reviews; Nontraditional Education; *Program Effectiveness; Program Evaluation; Research Design; Research Methodology; Research Needs; *Teacher Education Programs

ABSTRACT

This paper reviews studies that evaluate and compare teacher education programs. Literature was sought from the "Educational Index," "Current Index to Journals in Education," "Resources in Education," "Educational Resources Information Center," "Statistical Reference Index," and U.S. Government documents. Thirty-four studies provide a framework for: comparing teacher education programs with each other or with programs in other fields to determine trends and tendencies as well as differences; evaluating specific competencies associated with teacher education programs; discussing program effects on students; and comparing traditional and alternative teacher education programs. Based on the small number of studies available further comparisons between various types of teacher education programs are warranted. Future research should include a greater emphasis on observations of the participants; documentation of the actual practice of acquired teaching skills; and studies which investigate the kinds of teachers produced by particular programs, differences in outcomes of various programs, and the impact of adjunct versus full-time faculty teaching professional courses. Charts displaying the focus, scope, methodology, and findings of the studies comprise half the document. (Contains 35 references.) (LL)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED 365 665

REVIEW OF RESEARCH COMPARING TEACHER EDUCATION PROGRAMS

Carol Plata Etheridge
Department of Instruction and Curriculum Leadership
Memphis State University

Mary Lee Hall
Teacher Education Office
Memphis State University

Joni Roberts
Department of Instruction and Curriculum Leadership
Memphis State University

Technical Report No.

August, 1993

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

C Etheridge

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

SP034961

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Support for this study was provided by the Center for Research in Educational Policy, College of Education, Memphis State University. The views expressed herein are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the position or policy of the Center, the College, or the University. The Center for Research in Educational Policy is a Center of Excellence for the State of Tennessee.



Memphis State University is an Equal Opportunity/Affirmative Action University. It is committed to education of a non-racially identifiable student body.

This literature review examines studies that compare teacher education programs. Literature was sought from the *Educational Index, Current Index to Journals in Education, Resources in Education, Educational Resources Information Center, Statistical Reference Index,* and Government Documents. Studies in this review evaluated and compared teacher education programs or reviewed studies which compared programs. This review examines teacher education programs vs. other programs, specific competencies associated with teacher education programs, program effects on students, and comparisons of traditional and alternative teacher education programs.

Few people agree entirely on what teachers should know or what they should teach. Therefore, it is not surprising that a uniform curriculum for teacher education does not exist and is, instead, a highly debated academic, social, and politcal issue (Lilly, 1992). Several researchers (Scannell, 1987; Barnes, 1989; Goodlad, 1990; Kennedy, 1991; Olson, 1991) identified factors contributing to the lack of agreement on teacher education: the phenomenal increase in what teachers are required to know, changing societal expectations of teachers and schools, changing perceptions of teaching and learning, difficulty in identifying and clarifying the concept of teacher education, and the economic and planning considerations of adding additional time and coursework to current teacher education programs .

This lack of agreement was and continues to be the catalyst for generating interest in the formal evaluation of teacher education programs and research covering a multitude of other issues related to education. According to Galluzzo and Craig (1990), interest in program evaluation began to surface in the 1970's with the publication of *An Illustrated Model for the Evaluation of Teacher Education Graduates* (Sandefur,1970). Since then, there have been other model studies published which facilitate program evaluation such as *The Ohio State University Documentation and Monitoring System for NCATE Accreditation and State Department Program Approval*

(Loadman, Jahnke, & Zimpher, 1983) and *A Study Package for Examining and Tracking Changes in Teachers' Knowledge* (Kennedy, Ball, McDiarmid, & Schmidt, 1991).

Cruickshank and Cruz (1989) reported the following three major trends in teacher education based on *Teacher Education Reports* from 1986 to 1988: (a) Classroom teachers were becoming more involved in the advisement and governance of teacher education, (b) there was a movement towards improving teacher education programs, and (c) there was a movement towards improving the teaching force. These trends suggest that the need for evaluating and comparing teacher education programs is recognized by the public and the educational establishment.

Teacher Education Programs vs. Other Programs

One approach to evaluating teacher education programs has been to compare various teacher education programs with each other or with other fields to determine trends and tendencies as well as differences. Buttery, Haberman, and Houston (1990) conducted a national survey of 944 Association of Teacher Educators (ATE) members to determine what aspects of teacher education programs those professionals deemed as needing reform. The items ranked highest in importance were the need for mentoring of first-year teachers, better conditions in the public schools, more preparation for teaching in multicultural environments, evaluation of students entering teacher admission programs, and testing requirements for certification.

Galluzzo and Arends(1989) and Ishler (1984) conducted nation-wide surveys of various institutions to compare the admission and graduation standards of teacher education programs with those of other fields and found that they were comparable. Although the studies found that the grade point averages (GPA's) and standardized test scores of teacher education students were similar with other students, these studies did not take into account the extent to which departments of education and other academic departments grant exceptions to admission and graduation standards.

Based on studies conducted in 1967-1979, Hodges and Nash (1982) found that the reading and writing skills of education students as well as other students had been declining over the years. The authors suggest greater emphasis on reading and writing skills in education coursework and competency testing before issuing teaching certificates.

A study of certification requirements for special education by Chapey, Pyszkowski, and Trimarco (1985) found a large variation in special education programs and that special education programs received only sporadic attention with respect to consistency and evaluation. The authors suggested creating task forces to evaluate certification and training requirements in special education programs, more efforts towards uniformity and cooperation between states, and the development of models of teacher training.

Competencies Associated with Teacher Education Programs

Another approach to program evaluation has been to compare how different programs prepare teachers for specific competencies. A study by Jones (1987) included 456 post-secondary institutions in 27 states. She found that teachers were generally not prepared to teach in rural settings. Although the respondents expressed that there was a need for coursework in rural education, the majority of respondents reported that no time was allocated specifically for rural preservice preparation. The data from this study suggest that further research should be done in the area of rural education and that teacher education programs should be modified to include coursework in rural education.

Considering the increasing number of students who are being mainstreamed, Reiff, Evans, and Cass (1991) conducted a study to determine how well general education teachers were prepared to teach handicapped students. Of the 50 states surveyed, 48 responded; and it was found that 14 states did not require any special education courses, but the remaining 37 states did require varying amounts of special

education coursework. From 1974 to 1984 there was an increase in the number of states requiring preservice training to teach students with disabilities, and the trend appeared to indicate that additional states would be requiring special education training in the future. However, Reiff et al. (1991) suggest that before sweeping reforms and regulations were put into effect, further research needs to be done to determine the extent to which classroom teachers should be responsible for the education of exceptional students and the amount of preparation they will need to fulfill that responsibility.

Program Effects on Students

Some studies evaluated the effects various aspects of teacher education have on education students. Munby and Russell (1993) investigated the role experience played in developing the ability to teach, and Nortman (1991) studied the effect student teaching had on student attitudes. A paper by Wideen, Mayer-Smith, & Moon (1993) reviews a number of studies dealing with the effects of certain aspects of teacher education such as microteaching, internships, methods courses, practicums and education psychology courses. Each study evaluated one or two aspects of particular programs; however, none compared entire programs.

A publication list of studies by the National Center for Research on Teacher Learning (NCRTL) (1993) revealed numerous studies of teacher education. However, none of them compared entire programs but focused, instead, on individual aspects of programs, teacher attitudes, and philosophies of teacher education.

Traditional and Alternative Teacher Education Programs

Due to teacher shortages and the call for reform, there has been a plethora of alternative teacher education programs, and accompanying studies have been conducted to evaluate and compare entire teacher education programs. Traditional, four-year teacher education programs have been compared with extended/five-year, alternative certification, internship, and emergency permit programs. Young, Sandlin,

and Karge (1991) studied the differences between 24 beginning teachers who recently graduated from a traditional training program in California and 23 intern teachers. A written survey, classroom observations, follow-up telephone calls, and a follow-up survey on teacher concerns were used to determine the differences in developmental processes between the interns and traditionally trained teachers. The results of the initial survey, which assessed teacher satisfaction and determined sources of support, were that interns and beginning teachers had basically the same level of teaching satisfaction, but the interns reported more satisfaction with the level of support they received. Classroom observations showed that beginning teachers achieved a higher level of on-task activity than interns. Telephone interviews determined that all participants felt they had a successful first year of teaching, but the beginning teachers expressed a higher level of confidence and sense of accomplishment than did the interns. The follow-up survey revealed that the interns were concerned with themselves and teaching duties, while beginning teachers were concerned with how to be successful with their students. The implication was that the beginning teachers were further along in their development as teachers than the interns. Young et al. (1991) was concerned with the fact the initial findings showed that interns lag behind beginning teachers in their development. However, the study will follow the interns for five years in order to fully evaluate the effectiveness and viability of the internship program.

Etheridge, Butler, Etheridge, and James (1988) studied students' involvement in teaching activities during field experiences and the effects various programs had on students' views of student teaching and school-related components. The programs studied were a four-year traditional program with 10 to 12 weeks of student teaching, MAT program with a nine-month phased internship, and a graduate level internship program with a nine-month immersion internship. Data collection methods included ethnographic interviews and observations and the Teacher Induction Inventory (TII). It

was found that the three groups did not differ in levels of involvement in instructional activities such as recordkeeping, preparation, and implementation. However, the three groups differed significantly in non-instructional activities. Students in the traditional program and phased intership program reported higher involvement in observations of classroom instruction and non-instructional activities, while immersion interns reported higher levels of participation in parent conferences and school meetings. Immersion interns reported higher levels of tension in their experience than did the traditional students; and phased interns and traditional students generally had a more positive view of their teachers, students, and school than the interns. These findings suggest that the differences in age, levels of socialization within the programs, and the varying lengths of the programs might be responsible for the differences in the students' views.

Several other studies (Boser, Wiley, & Pettibone,1986; Etheridge, Franceshine, & Barnette,1988; Arch, 1989; Hawk & Schmidt, 1989; Brown, Edington, Spencer, & Tinafero,1989; Guyton, Fox, & Sisk,1991; Hines, Hall, Motika, & Fry,1993) compared alternative teacher preparation programs with traditional programs based on surveys or various combinations of surveys and interviews and observations. These studies found that the students trained in alternate and extended certification programs generally performed as well or better than traditionally trained teachers on coursework, certification tests and classroom performance. However, longitudial studies were recommended to determine if differences in knowledge or performance appear over time. Howey and Zimpher (1986) and Gallegos (1981) expressed concern over the cost and planning involved in alternative certification and extended programs. Most alternative programs enroll small numbers of students, and as Hines et al. (1993) suggest, internship programs are probably not suited to train large numbers of teachers. The need to determine why programs attract different kinds of students and to document the development of skills are important in determining the

circumstances under which various programs should be used (Arch, 1989; Cyphert & Ryan, 1984).

Conclusion

Based on the small number of studies comparing teacher education programs and the youth of research on teacher education in general, further comparisons between various types of teacher education programs are warranted. Of the 34 studies reviewed, only a few included observations of the participants, so most of the research was based on questionnaires. Future research should include a greater emphasis on observation of the participants and documentation of the actual practice of acquired teaching skills. Other areas of teacher education which merit further attention are studies which investigate the kinds of teachers produced by particular programs, the differences in outcomes of various programs, and the impact of adjuct versus full-time faculty teaching professional courses.

References

Arch, E.C. (1989, March). Comparison of student attainment of teaching competencies in traditional preservice and fifth-year master of arts in teaching programs. Paper presented ath the Annual Meeting of the American Education Research Association, San Francisco, CA.

Barnes, H. (1989). Structuring knowledge for beginning teaching. In M.C. Reynolds (Ed.), Knowledge base for the beginning teacher (pp. 13-22). New York: Pergamon.

Boser, J.A., Wiley, P.D., & Pettibone, T.J. (1986, November). A comparison of participants in traditional and alternative teacher preparation programs. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Mid-South Educational Research Association, Memphis, TN.

Brown, D., Edington, E., Spencer, D., & Tinafero, J. (1989). A comparison of alternative certification, traditionally trained, and emergency permit teachers. Teacher Education and Practice, 5(2), 21-23.

Buttery, T.J., Haberman, M., & Houston W. R. (1990). ATE: First annual survey of critical issues in teacher education. XI, (23), 1, 12-15.

Chapey, G.D., Pyszkowski, I.S., & Trimarco, T.A. (1985). National trends for certification and training of special education teachers. Teacher Education and Special Education , 8(4), 209-208.

Cruickshank, D.R. & Cruz, J., Jr.(1989). Trends in teacher preparation. Journal of Teacher Education, 40(3), 49-56.

Cyphert, F.R., & Ryan, K.A. (1984). Extending initial teacher preparation: Some issues and answers. Action in Teacher Education, 6, 63-70.

Etheridge, C.P., Butler, E.D., Etheridge, G.W., & James, T. (1988, February). The effects of type of teacher preparation program on internships in secondary schools. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting for the American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education, New Orleans, LA.

Etheridge, C.P., Franceschine, L. & Barnette, J.J. (1988, November). Assessment of beginning teachers' professional behaviors: Administrators and supervisors speak. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Mid-South Educational Research Association, Louisville, KY.

Gallegos, A.M. (1981). The dilemma of extended/five year programs. Journal of Teacher Education, 32(1), 4-6.

Galluzzo, G.R., & Arends, R.I. (1989). The RATE Project: A profile of teacher education institutions. Journal of Teacher Education, 40(4), 56-58.

Galluzzo, G.R. & Craig, J.R. (1990). Evaluation of preservice teacher education programs. In W.R. Houston (Ed.), Handbook of research on teacher education (pp. 599-616). New York: Macmillan.

Goodlad, J.I. (1990). Teachers for our nation's schools. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Guyton, E., Fox, M.C., & Sisk, K.A. (1991). Comparison of teaching attitudes, teacher efficacy, and teacher performance of first year teachers prepared by alternative and traditional teacher education programs. 1, 13(2), 1-9.

Hawk, P.P, & Schmidt, M.W. (1989). Teacher preparation: A comparison of traditional and alternative programs. Journal of Teacher Education, 40(5), 53-58.

Hines, C.V., Hall, B.W., Motika, R.T. & Fry, B.V. (1993, April). The Florida experience in alternate teacher preparation: A four-year study of its effectiveness in preparing new teachers. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Atlanta, GA.

Hodges, V.P., & Nash, A.M. (1982, March). Should teacher training institutions be concerned about the reading and writing skills of future teachers? Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Washington Organization Reading Development for International Reading Association, Seattle, WA.

Howey, K.R., & Zimpher, N.L. (1986). The current debate on teacher preparation. Journal of Teacher Education, 37(5), 41-49.

Ishler, R.E. (1984). Requirements for admission to and graduation from teacher education. Phi Delta Kappan, 66, 121-122.

Jones, B.J. (1987). Preservice programs for rural environments: Survey and recommendations. Research in Rural Education, 4(1), 3-8.

Kennedy, M.M. (1991). Genres in teacher education. (Issue Paper 91-1). East Lansing, MI: National Center for Research on Teacher Learning. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 337 453)

Kennedy, M.M., Ball, D.L., McDiarmid, G.W., & Schmidt, W. (1991). A study package for examining and tracking changes in teachers' knowledge. (Technical Series 91-1). East Lansing: Michigan State University, The National Center for Research on Teacher Education.

Lilly, M.S. (1992). Research on teacher licensure and state approval of teacher education programs. Teacher Education and Special Education, 15, 148-160.

Loadman, W., Jahnke, J. & Zimpher, N. (1983). The Ohio State University Documentation and Monitoring System for NCATE Accreditation and State Deparment Program Approval. Ohio State University, Columbus College of Education. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 288 180)

Munby, H. & Russell, T. (1993, April). The authority of experience in learning to teach: Messages from a physics methods class. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Atlanta, GA.

Nortman, M.L. (1991, February). Student teacher attitudes and attitude change. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the Association of Teacher Educators, New Orleans, LA.

NCRTL Publications List. (1993). East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University, National Center for Research on Teacher Learning.

Olson, L. (1990). Colleges of education under increasing attack as weak link in the drive to improve nation's schools. Education Week, 10(15),11-26.

Olson, L. (1991). Reformers seek to untangle web of rules, regulations to improve quality, spark innovation in teacher training. Education Week, 10(27), 11-16.

Reed, H.B. (1975). Evaluation of alternative approaches to teacher preparation. Univeristy of Massachusettes. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 147 335)

Reiff, H., Evans, E., & Cass, M. (1991). Special education requirements for general education certification: A national survey of current practices. Remedial and Special Education, 12(5), 56-60.

Scannell, D.P. (1987). Fifth year and extended programs. In M. Haberman & J.M. Backus (Eds.), Advances in Teacher Education: Vol. 3 (pp. 168-180). Norwood, NJ: Ablex.

Sandefur, J. T. (1970). An illustrated model for the evaluation of teacher education graduates. Washington, D. C.: American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education.

Wideen, M.F., Mayer-Smith, J.A., & Moon, B.J. (1993, April). The research on learning to teach: prospect and problems. Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association, Atlanta, GA.

Young, B.L., Sandlin, R.A., & Karge, B.D. (1991). The effectiveness of teaching internships as a viable route to California alternative certification. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 336 381)

TABLE 1: FOCUS AND SCOPE OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Focus	Scope
Arch, E.C., 1989	Comparison of 4-year, 5-year and,MAT programs	43 students at a small liberal arts college
Barnes, H., 1989	Research and reform in teacher education	National
Boser, J.A, Wiley, P.D., & Pettibone, T.J., 1986	Comparison of 4-year, 5-year and intership program	79 students at UT Knoxville
Brown, D., Edington, D.S. & Tinafero, J., 1989	Comparison of alternative & traditionally trained & emergency permit teachers	63 teachers from 2 school districts in El Paso Co., TX
Buttery, T.J., Haberman, M., & Houston, W.R., 199	Critical issues in teacher education	National
Chapey, G.D., Pyszkowski, I.S., & Trimarco, T.A., 1985	National trends for certification and training of special education teachers	Directors of special education (or related position) in 50 states and the District of Columbia

TABLE 1: FOCUS AND SCOPE OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Focus	Scope
Cyphert, F.R. & Ryan, K. A., 1984	Issues on extending initial teacher preparation	National
Etheridge, C.P., Butler, D.E., Etheridge, G.W. & James, T., 1988	Effects of teacher preparation program on internships in secondary schools	110 education students attending Memphis State University
Etheridge, C.P., Franceshine, L., Barnette, J., 1988	Comparison of MAT & Cohort to regular beginning teachers	56 education students at Memphis State University
Gallegos, A.M., 1981	Extended/Five-Year Programs	National
Galluzzo, G.R., & Arends, R.I., 1989	Profile of teacher education students	National
Galluzzo, G.R., & Craig, J.R., 1990	History of teacher education program evaluation	National
Goodlad, J.I., 1990	Teacher education reform	National
Guyton, E., Fox, M., & Sisk, K., 1991	Comparison of alternate and traditionally trained teachers	49 teachers in Georgia

TABLE 1: FOCUS AND SCOPE OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Focus	Scope
Hines, C., Hall, B. Motika, R. & Fry, B., 1993	Alternative training program effectiveness	303 education students in 6 Florida alternative training program centers
Hodges, V.P., & Nash, A.M., 1982	Reading and writing skills of future teachers	National
Howey, K., & Zimpher, N., 1986	Comparison of 4-year and extended programs	National
Ishler, R.E., 1984	Admission and graduation requirements for teacher education programs	National
Jones, B., 1987	Preservice programs for rural environments	208 respondents from 27 states
Kennedy, M., 1991	Teacher education	National
Kennedy, M., Ball, D., McDiarmid, G. & Schmidt, W., 1991	Longitudinal comparison of teachers as they participated in a variety of TEPs, Math & Writing to diverse learners	
Loadman, W., Jahnke, J., & Zimpher, N., 1983	Ohio State University documentation and monitoring system for NCATE accreditation	Ohio State University

TABLE 1: FOCUS AND SCOPE OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Focus	Scope
National Center for Research on Teacher Education, 1993	Teacher education publications	
Nortman, M.L., 1991	Effects of student teaching on attitudes of elementary and secondary students	205 education students from 3 central Ohio universities
Olson, L. 1990	Criticisms of teacher education	
Olson, L. 1991	Reform in teacher education	
Reed, H.B., 1975	Evaluation of alternative teacher education programs	271 graduates of 19 Univ. of Massachusettes alternative teacher education programs
Reiff, H.B., Evans, E.D. & Cass, M., 1991	Special education requirements for general education certification	50 states and the District of Columbia
Scannell, D.P., 1987	Reviews of literature on extended programs	National

TABLE 1: FOCUS AND SCOPE OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Focus	Scope
Young, B.L., Sandlin, R.A., & Karge, B.D. 1991	Differences between interns and traditionally trained teachers	23 interns and 24 beginning teachers who graduated from California State Univ.

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Arch, E.C., 1989	Student teacher evaluation forms and programs evaluation forms	•MATs rated higher than certification only by supervisors •Students rated learning more theory than practice •Longitudinal follow-up studies needed •Need to document development of skills
Barnes, H., 1989	Literature review	•Views of teaching and learning have changed •Need TEP's that develop frameworks for thinking about teaching and teachers capacity to engage in intelletual dialogue •Need integrated perception of teaching
Boser, J.A., Wiley, P.D., & Pettibone, T.J., 1986	Student records, follow-up questionnaires and telephone calls, participant evaluation questionnaires, superintendent interviews, and principal and mentor program questionnaires	•5-year students and interns scored better on NTE than 4-year students, GPA's and performance ratings similar •Intern programs rely on public school systems •Concerns about costs and planning
Brown, D., Edington, E., Spencer, D.A., & Tinafero, J., 1989	Students records, observation using Texas Teacher Appraisal System (TTAS)	•Academic achievement and classroom performance of all groups were similar •Alternative certification students performed equal to or better than traditionally trained teachers •Further research and examination of correlation between TTAS scores with student achievement recommended

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Chapey, G.D., Pyszkowski, I.S., & Trimarco, T.A., 1985	Questionnaire	•Large variation in special ed. programs, special ed. programs receive sporadic attention •Need task force to evaluate certification and training requirements in special ed. •Need more cooperation between states •Need models of teacher training
Cruikshank, D.R. & Cruz, J., 1989	Review of *Teacher Education Reports*	Movement toward involving classroom teachers in advisement and governance of teacher education, improving preparation programs for teachers, and improving teaching force
Cyphert, F.R. & Ryan, K.A., 1984	Survey	•Concerns about cost and planning involved in extended programs •Need further research on extended teacher preparation programs
Etheridge, C.P., Butler, D.E., Etheridge, G.W. & Janes, T., 1988	Observations using Teacher Induction Inventory (TTI) and ethnographic interviews	•Three groups did not differ in levels of involvement in instructinal activities but differed significantly in non-instructional activities. •Since findings might relate to length and nature of program, further studies are needed.
Etheridge, C.P. Franceshine, L., Barnette, J., 1988	Professional Behavior Inventory (PBI) and interviews	Administators rated interns higher than traditionally trained teachers ,and supervisors rated interns equal with traditionally trained teachers.

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Galluzzo, G.R., & Arends, R.I., 1989	Review of data from RATE Project	•Increase in TE enrollments, GPA requirements rising, education majors top 30% of high school class •Teacher Education programs are similar but will need to change to accomodate increasing enrollment.
Galluzzo, G.R., & Craig, J.R., 1990	Review of literature	•Interest in evaluation of teacher education programs originated in the 1970's •Increasing numbers of institutions are evaluating their programs •Evaluation of programs is important in reaching consensus on how teachers should be prepared.
Goodlad, J.I., 1990	Review of literature	•Unclear missions, goals, and admission standards in colleges of ed. •Irrelevant classes, lack of public support, regulations viewed as cumbersome and costly •Reform should be immediate and short term •Need for remediation for poor performance on skills tests •Need to work toward cohesive scope and sequence •Need formative evaluations of student of teacher education
Guyton, E., Fox, M., & Sisk, K., 1991	Educational Attitudes Inventory (EAI), Teaching Attitudes Inventory (TAI), Teacher Efficacy Scale, and Beginning Teachers Evaluation Form	•The alternatively trained teachers scored comparable to traditionally trained teachers •The alternative program is costly: further study needed to determine if efficient on a large scale

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Hines, C., Hall, B., Motika, R., & Fry, B., 1993	Interviews, surveys, observations based on Florida Performance Measurement SYstem (FPMS), test scores on Florida Teacher Certification Examination (FTCE), and portfolios	The alternate teacher preparation program was unable to provide adequate university- based supervision, had limited funding, is not viable option for training large numbers of teachers.
Hodges, V.P., & Nash, A.M., 1982	Literature review	•Potential teachers had poor reading and writing skills and resisted teacher testing; college students in general resisted writing •Emphasize reading and writing skills in TE curriculum and test before certifying
Howey, K., & Zimpher, N., 1986	Literature review	Questions to consider are how to attract candidate for extended programs, how not to discriminate against minorities and low income students, and what form of accountability to match professional teacher training and status.
Ishler, R.E., 1984	Survey	Teacher education students score and perform equally as well or higher than students in other programs.
Jones, B.J., 1987	Survey	•Teachers are not prepared to teach in rural settings •Need coursework in rural ed. and further research in rural ed.

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Kennedy, M., Ball, D., McDiarmid, G., & Schmidt, W., 1991		Study guide for evaluation of change in teacher knowledge
Lilly, M.S., 1992	Literature review	•Teacher licensure and program approval are largely socio-political events •Need to use research more in policy making, need further research •Need to document effects of programs •Need cooperation between educators and policy makers •Models of accountability will become more outcome than process-driven.
Loadman, W., Jahnke, J., & Zimpher, N., 1983		Model for evaluating teacher education programs
Munby, H. & Russell, T., 1993	Tape recorded student comments	•Coursework was irrelevant, learning restricted by cooperating teachers and supervisors •Prior beliefs interfere with learning from experience •Students don't recognize authority of their own experiences •Use research on teacher education in teacher education: metaphor, life histories, narratives and journals

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Nortman, M.L., 1991	Educational Beliefs Inventory (EBI)	•There was a difference in attitudes regarding discipline, affective goals, and positive feelings towards students •Secondary teachers were more traditional than elementary teachers •Need further study of students teacher attitudes
Olson, L., 1990	Literature Review	•Problems were recruiting and retaining minorities, old- fashioned mind sets, lack of clear mission, incoherent programs, inadequate funding, lack of content knowledge, state regulations •Need recruit from top students, articulate vision, cooperation between higher ed. and public schools, wiser spending, deregulate curriculum, national NCATE standards
Olson, L., 1991	Literature review	•Problems were. . . too many state regs., distrust in teacher education, politics •Need less prescriptive- more outcome-based programs •Evaluate programs on outcomes •Deny approval of funding to inferior institutions •Reach agreement on what teachers should know •Establish a national system

TABLE 2: METHODOLOGY AND FINDINGS OF STUDIES

Author(s)	Methodology	Findings/Suggestions
Reiff, H.B., Evans, E.D., & Cass, M., 1991	Survey	•All states required certfication •14 state had no spec. ed. req. for elementary ed. •31 states required intro. to special ed. • 6 states mentioned competency requirement but did not require course •Exposure to special ed. coursework important for general ed. but drastic means not necessary
Scannell, D.P., 1987	Literature review	•Rapid expansion of knowledge base for teachers •Teacher education programs have not evolved to the extend of other fields •Nature of school and expectations of teachers have changed drastically •4- year model cannot give adequate attention to necessary components of TE •Need further research in teacher education
Wideen, M.R., Mayer-Smith, J.A., & Moon, B.J., 1993	Literature review	Studies address effects of aspects of teacher education such as microteaching, internships, methods courses, practicums and education psychology courses
Young, B., Sandlin, R.A., & Karge, B.D., 1991	California New Teacher Program Survey and classroom observations	•Traditionally trained teachers wanted more help with curriculum and time management skills •Interns wanted help with classroom mgt. discipline, special ed. students, and administrative access and support •Need longitudinal study of interns and further studies of intern programs